

LAS6938/ANG6930 People and Protected Areas

Spring 2016

Time: Friday 12:50-3:50 pm Location: Grinter 376

Professor: Dr. Catherine Tucker

Office: Grinter 309

Phone: 352-392-0690

Email: tuckerc@ufl.edu

Office Hours: Tuesday 2:00-3:00 pm

Thursday 1:30-3:00 pm

& By Appointment

Course Description:

The creation of protected areas has become a principal tool for attempting to conserve endangered natural resources and biological diversity. Yet biosphere reserves, national parks and nature reserves have often had unanticipated ramifications for local populations. In certain cases, failures to consider sociocultural, political and economic contexts of protected area creation and maintenance have led to unexpected problems including accelerated environmental degradation. Protected areas also carry implications for cultural survival. A majority of the world's indigenous and traditional populations live in the world's least degraded environments, but at times park establishment has involved the forcible expulsion of native peoples from their land. The failures and conflicts in many protected areas have raised doubts over their effectiveness, yet policy initiatives continue to emphasize top-down protected area creation over other possibilities for conservation. This seminar-style course explores a broad range of questions and debates surrounding efforts to protect natural resources. It considers major theories and approaches for conservation, from "fortress conservation" to community-based and joint management strategies. It evaluates outcomes and unintended consequences of protected areas, with special interest in the conundrums posed by neoliberal economic policies and associated demands for increasingly depleted and threatened natural resources. We will consider crucial questions, such as (1) Are protected areas effective? Given the varying goals and contexts of different protected areas, how can effectiveness be assessed? (2) Under what circumstances can natural resources be managed sustainably? (What works? What doesn't? Why?) (3) How may cultural survival and environmental conservation be supported as complimentary rather than competing goals? (4) Is it possible for conservation efforts to simultaneously support poverty alleviation and social justice? If so, how?

Required Texts:

Brockington, D., R. Duffy & J. Igoe. 2008. *Nature Unbound: Conservation, Capitalism, and the Future of Protected Areas*. London: Earthscan.

Grandia, L. 2012. *Enclosed: Conservation, Cattle and Commerce among the Q'echi' Maya Lowlanders*. Seattle: University of Washington Press.

Terborgh, J. 1999. *Requiem for Nature*. Washington: Island Press.

Readings on Canvas:

If a reading is not in a required text, it will be on Canvas/Files/Readings. Alternatively a URL will be provided.

Notes:

- Readings may be adjusted in response to class interest or developments.
- To facilitate discussion, come to class prepared to discuss the readings assigned for that day.

COURSE EVALUATION AND EXPECTATIONS

Class Requirements/ Graded Elements (400 pts):

- 1) Reading Response: 1 (25 pts). Submit a digital copy to Canvas and a hard copy to Dr. Tucker at the start of class.
- 2) Discussion Co-Leadership for two topics (two class meetings), including notes, critical analysis and questions for the class to facilitate discussion (50 pts each, 100 pts total)
- 3) Research project & design proposal (50 pts)
- 4) Field notes on observations of a local protected area (50 pts)
- 5) Research presentation (75 pts)
- 6) Research Paper (100 pts): 12-20 pages on a research project exploring a relevant topic of your choice. Submit a digital copy to Canvas and a hard copy to Dr. Tucker.

Discussion and participation during class is a key component of this class. If you will be unable to attend every class, please let Dr. Tucker know promptly to discuss options for making up missed discussions.

Grading Policy:

The course will be graded by standard percentages; the grade will not be curved. Any late assignment will be discounted 20% per day after the deadline. This is only fair to those in the class who meet the deadline; they would be disadvantaged relative to those who take more time. In-class participation points cannot be made up except in the case of an emergency.

Canvas:

Canvas will be used to post the syllabus, grades, announcements, required readings, assignment guidelines, handouts and powerpoint presentations. In addition to submitting a hard copy of your work, you are expected to upload a digital copy of your written work in the course to Canvas. Failure to do so will result in a 10% grade deduction.

Policy on Plagiarism / Cheating:

Plagiarism in written assignments (i.e. the copying of material without citation of the source) and cheating on examinations are unacceptable behaviors in the university. They will lead to a zero on the assignment or examination if they are of a minor nature, and to a failing grade in the course in cases of extensive cheating (i.e. more than two lines copied or two questions cheated on). If you are in doubt about what is the proper manner of citation of sources feel free to discuss this with Dr. Tucker. It is recommended that you purchase a guideline to these matters.

Policy for Emergency Situations:

If you have a medical, family or personal emergency that prevents you from attending class or completing an assignment on time, bring it to the attention of professor immediately. Reasonable adjustments in due dates and participation will be made with adequate and timely communication.

CLASS SCHEDULE

Week 1 - January 8: Introduction: Protected Area Issues and Fundamental Concepts: Common-Pool Resources and Institutions (Rules-in-Use)

For Reference:

Dudley, N., ed 2013 IUCN Guidelines for Applying Protected Area Management Categories. Best Practice Protected Area Guidelines Series No. 21. World Commission on Protected Areas

National Park Service: The Wilderness Idea

<http://wilderness.nps.gov/idea.cfm>

Protected Planet - Online Database of Protected Areas around the world

<http://www.protectedplanet.net>

National Parks Worldwide

http://nationalparks-worldwide.info/national_parks/iucn_categories_protected_areas.htm

IUCN Protected Area Categories <http://www.eoearth.org/view/article/153745/>

If not read in other classes: Hardin, G. 1968. The Tragedy of the Commons. *Science* 162:1243-1248.

Week 2 - January 15: Histories of Protected Areas and Imperatives for Conservation: How Did Protected Areas Develop Historically? What are some of the principal conundrums for conservation by protected areas?

Due: Reading Response: Identify and assess key issues for conservation and protected areas in these readings (providing in-text references). In light of these authors' writing, offer your perspective on the most crucial challenges for conservation today. Maximum 4 double-spaced pages. You may refer to additional sources if you wish (optional) in which case, include full references.

Video: The Wilderness Idea View before class on Jan 15.

(Youtube: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=G1CC_wT059s)

Readings:

Brockington et al. Ch. 1 Nature Unbound. Ch.2 Histories and Geographies of Protected Areas. Ch.3 The Imperatives for Conservation. *Nature Unbound* Pp. 1-62.

Terborgh, J. Preface; Ch.1: The Making of a Dissident; Ch 2: Assessing the Present. Pp. ix-22. *Requiem for Nature*.

Week 3- January 22: Examining Arguments for Conservation and Strict Nature Reserves ("Fortress Conservation")

Due: Bring two questions for Discussion inspired by the readings.

Readings:

Terborgh, J. Ch.3 Paradise Fading; Pp. Ch. 4 The Danger Within; Ch 5: Parks, the Last Bastions of Nature; Ch 6: Protecting Biodiversity. Pp. 23-101.

Brockington, et al. Ch 4 The Power of Parks *Nature Unbound* Pp. 63-85.

Götmark, F., K. Kirby, M. Usher. 2015 Strict Reserves, IUCN Classification, and the use of reserves for scientific research: a comment on Schultz. *Biodiversity Conservation* 24:3621-3625.

Week 4- January 29: Community-based Management of Commons: Can Community-Based Protected Areas Work?
Guest Lecturer: Prof. Karen Kainer

Readings:

Brockington, et al. Ch 5 Local Management of Natural Resources. *Nature Unbound*.

Cox, M., G. Arnold, and S. Villamayor Tomás. 2010. A review of design principles for community-based natural resource management. *Ecology and Society* 15(4):38
<http://www.ecologyandsociety.org/vol15/iss4/art38/>

Grandia, L. Preface (Pp. xi-xix) & Introduction: Commons Past. *Enclosed*. Pp. 3-28.

Supplementary Readings:

Dietz, T., E. Ostrom and P. C. Stern. 2003. The Struggle to Govern the Commons. *Science* 302: 1907-1911.

Dietz et al. 2003 Online Supplementary Material

Ostrom, E. 1990. Ch. 6 Analyzing long-enduring, self-organized and self-governed CPRs. *Governing the Commons*, Pp. 58-102.

Week 5- February 5: Protecting Nature and Defining Conservation in Urban Settings. The Example of the Plum Creek Development Proposal in Gainesville, FL

Readings: TBA

Start Reading Grandia!

Week 6- February 12: Part 1: Diverse Perspectives on Indigenous Experiences with Enclosure & Protected Areas.

Readings:

Brockington et al. Ch. 6 Conservation and Indigenous Peoples. *Nature Unbound*.

Grandia. Ch 1, Ch. 3 Commons, Customs and Carrying Capacities, Ch 4 Speculating: the World Bank's Market Assisted Land Reform, Ch 6 The PPP and the DR-CAFTA. *Enclosed*. (Recommended but Optional: Ch 2 & 5)

Stevens, S. ed. 2014. A New Protected Area Paradigm. In *Indigenous Peoples, National Parks, and Protected Areas: A New Paradigm Linking Conservation, Culture, Rights*. Tucson: University of Arizona Press. Pp. 47-83

Readings on the Debate to Exclude Indigenous Peoples from Protected Areas:

Alcorn, J. 1993. Indigenous People and Conservation. *Conservation Biology* 7(2): 424-426.

Redford and Stearman 1993. On Common Ground? Response to Alcorn. *Biodiversity Conservation* 7(2):427-428.

Colchester, M. 2000. Self-Determination or Environmental Determinism for Indigenous Peoples in Tropical Forest Conservation. *Conservation Biology* 14(5):1365-1367.

Redford, K. H. and S. E. Sanderson. 2000. Extracting Humans from Nature. *Conservation Biology* 14(5):1365-1367.

Schwartzman, S., A. Moreira, and D. Nepstad. 2000. Rethinking Tropical Forest Conservation: Perils in Parks. *Conservation Biology* 14(5):1351-1357.

Peres, C. A. and B. Zimmermann. 2001. Perils in Parks or Parks in Peril? Reconciling Conservation in Amazonian Reserves with and without Use. *Conservation Biology* 15(3):793-797.

On the Web:

Ginzburg, O. 2006. There You Go! <http://www.survivalinternational.org/thereyougo>

UN Declaration on Indigenous Peoples Rights. 2007.
http://www.un.org/esa/socdev/unpfii/documents/DRIPS_en.pdf

Supplementary:

Redford and Stearman 1993. Forest-Dwelling Native Amazonians and Biodiversity Conservation: Interests in Common or in Collision? *Conservation Biology* 7:248-255.

Week 7- February 19: FIELD TRIP (TBA)

Week 8- February 26: NGOs, States and Corporations in Protected Areas: Hegemonies, Critiques, and the Challenge of Development

Readings:

Adams, W. et al. 2004. Biodiversity Conservation and the Eradication of Poverty. *Science* 306(5699):1146-1149.

Brockington et al. Ch. 8 International Conservation. *Nature Unbound*. Pp. 149-173.

Chapin, M. 2004. A Challenge to Conservationists. *World Watch Magazine*. Pp. 17-31.

Smith, R. C. 2005. Can David and Goliath Have a Happy Marriage? The Machiguenga People and the Camisea Gas Project in the Peruvian Amazon. In *Communities and Conservation*. Altamira Press. Lanham, MD: Pp. 231-255.

Tucker, C. M. 2004. Community Institutions and Forest Management in Mexico's Monarch Butterfly Reserve. *Society and Natural Resources* 17:569-587.

Supplementary:

Agnoletti, M. and I. Rotherham. 2015. Landscape and Biocultural Diversity. *Biodiversity Conservation* 24:3155-3165.

Week 9: SPRING BREAK

Week 10- March 11: Ecotourism, Recreation, and Innovations in Conservation of Protected Areas.

Readings (Pending Additions):

Brockington et al. Ch. 7 The Spread of Tourist Habitat. *Nature Unbound*.

Week 11 - March 18: - Are Protected Areas Effective? Perspectives on Assessing Success

Due: Research Project Proposal

Readings:

Bruner, A., R. Gullison, R. Rice, G. da Fonseca. 2001. Effectiveness of Parks in Protecting Tropical Biodiversity. *Science* 291:125-128.

Hayes, T. 2006. Parks, People and Forest Protection: An Institutional Assessment of the Effectiveness of Protected Areas. *World Development* 34(12): 2064-2075.

Stern, M. et al. 2001. Parks and Factors in Their Success (Responses to Bruner, et al.). *Science* 293:1045-1047.

Terborgh, J. Ch. 10: Why Conservation in the Tropics is Failing. Ch.11: Hard Choices in the 21st Century. In *Requiem for Nature*. Pp. 161-186.

Supplementary Readings:

Grandia. Conclusion: Common Futures. *Enclosed* Pp. 171-197.

Nagendra, H. et al. 2004. Monitoring Parks through Remote Sensing: Studies in Nepal and Honduras. *Environmental Management* 33(3):1-13.

Terborgh, J. Ch.12: Nature, a Global Commons. Pp. 187-208.

Vogt, N. 2006. Understanding the Stability of Forest Reserve Boundaries in the West Mingo Region of Uganda. *Ecology and Society* 11(3):38. [Online] URL: <http://www.ecologyandsociety.org/vol11/iss1/art38>)

Week 12 - March 25: Class Discussion- How can protected areas and conservation efforts be improved? What works, under what circumstances, and why? What other approaches could support conservation?

Readings:

Lewis, D. et al. 2011. Community Markets for Conservation (COMACO) links biodiversity conservation with sustainable improvements in livelihoods and food production. *PNAS* 108(34): 13957-13962.

Ostrom, E. 2005. Ch. 9 Robust Resource Governance in Polycentric Institutions. In *Understanding Institutional Diversity*. Pp. 255-

Saterson, K. A., et al. 2004. Disconnects in Evaluating the Relative Effectiveness of Conservation Strategies. *Conservation Biology* 18(3):597-599.

Salafsky, N., R. Margoluis, K. H. Redford, and J. G. Robinson. 2002. Improving the Practice of Conservation: a Conceptual Framework and Research Agenda for Conservation Science. *Conservation Biology* 16(6):1469-1479.

Week 13, April 1: Tucker Away at Professional Conference (American Association of Geographers)

Week 14, April 8: Research Project Presentations

Week 15, April 15: Final Discussion: Where do we go from here? Probable, Possible and Paradisiacal Futures

Readings:

Fortmann, L. 2005. What We Need is a Community Bambi: The Perils and Possibilities of Powerful Symbols. In *Communities and Conservation*. Pp. 195-205.

Week 16, April 22: Reading Day

FINAL EXAM WEEK: Final Research Paper Due April 25 by 5 p.m. on CANVAS and hard copy to Dr. Tucker

SUPPLEMENTARY READINGS (Available on Canvas/Resources/Supplementary Readings):

Berkes, Fikret

2004 Rethinking Community-Based Conservation. *Conservation Biology* 18(3):621-630.

Kusters, Koen, et al.

2006 Balancing Development and Conservation? An Assessment of Livelihood and Environmental Outcomes of Nontimber Forest Product Trade in Asia, Africa, and Latin America. *Ecology and Society* 11(2):20.

- McLean, Joanne, and Steffen StræDe
 2003 Conservation, Relocation, and the Paradigms of Park and People Management--
 A Case Study of Padampur Villages and the Royal Chitwan National Park, Nepal.
Society and Natural Resources 16(6):509-526.
- White, Andy, Arvind Khare, and Augusta Molnar
 2004 *Who Owns, Who Conserves and Why It Matters*. Wash., DC: Forest Trends.
- Wilkie, David S., et al.
 2006 Parks and People: Assessing the Human Welfare Effects of Establishing
 Protected Areas for Biodiversity Conservation. *Conservation Biology* 20(1):247-249.
- Wunder, Sven
 2006 Are Direct Payments for Environmental Services Spelling Doom for Sustainable
 Forest Management in the Tropics? *Ecology and Society* 11(2):23.

FURTHER READING

- Agrawal, Arun, and Clark Gibson, eds.
 2001 *Communities and the Environment: Ethnicity, Gender, and the State in
 Community-Based Conservation*. New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press.
- Ascher, William
 1999 *Why Governments Waste Natural Resources: Policy Failures in Developing
 Countries*. Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press.
- Berkes, Fikret.
 1999. *Sacred Ecology*. New York: Routledge.
- Brandon, Katrina, Kent H. Redford, and Steven E. Sanderson, eds.
 1998 *Parks in Peril: People, Politics, and Protected Areas*. Washington, D.C.: Island
 Press.
- Carson, Rachel
 2002 (1962). *Silent Spring*. New York: Mariner Books.
- Child, Brian, ed.
 2004 *Parks in Transition: Biodiversity, Rural Development and the Bottom Line*.
 London: IUCN/Earthscan/SASUSG.
- Gezon, Lisa
 1997 Institutional Structure and the Effectiveness of Integrated Conservation and
 Development Projects: Case Study from Madagascar. *Human Organization* 56(4):462-
 470.
- Gibson, Clark C., Margaret A. McKean, and Elinor Ostrom, eds.
 2000 *People and Forests: Communities, Institutions, and Governance*. Cambridge,
 MA: MIT Press.
- Igoe, Jim
 2004 *Conservation and Globalization: A Study of National Parks and Indigenous
 Communities from East Africa to South Dakota*. Belmont, California: Wadsworth/
 Thompson Learning.
- Leopold, Aldo.
 2001 (1949). *A Sand County Almanac (Outdoor Essays and Reflections)*. New York:
 Oxford University Press.
- Liu, Jianguo, et al.
 2001 Ecological Degradation in Protected Areas: The Case of Wolong Nature Reserve
 for Giant Pandas. *Science Reprint* 292:98-101.
- 2000 Changes in Human Population Structure and Implications for Biodiversity
 Conservation. *Population and Environment* 21(1).

- Muir, John.
1997. *John Muir: Nature Writings*. New York: Library Classics, Library of America.
- Nash, Roderick F.
2001 *Wilderness and the American Mind. Fourth Edition*. New Haven: Yale University Press.
- O'Neill, Karen M.
1996 The International Politics of National Parks. *Human Ecology* 24(4):521-539.
- Ostrom, Elinor, et al., eds.
2002 *Drama of the Commons*. Washington, DC: National Academy Press.
- Oelschlager, Max.
1991 *The Idea of Wilderness*. Binghamton, NY: Yale University and Vail-Ballou Press.
- Peres, Carlos A.
1994 Indigenous Reserves and Nature Conservation in Amazonian Forests. *Conservation Biology* 8(2):586-588.
- Redford, Kent H., and J. Peter Brosius
2006 Diversity and homogenization in the endgame. *Global Environmental Change* 16:317-319.
- Sanchez-Azofeifa, G. Arturo, et al.
2002 Dynamics of Tropical Deforestation Around National Parks: Remote Sensing of Forest Change on the Osa Peninsula of Costa Rica. *Mountain Research and Development* 22(4):352-358.
- Schwartz, Mark W.
1999 Choosing the Appropriate Scale of Reserves for Conservation. *Annual Review of Ecology and Systematics* 30:83-108.
- Vandermeer, John, and Ivette Perfecto
2005 *Breakfast of Biodiversity: The Political Ecology of Rain Forest Destruction*. Oakland, CA: Institute for Food and Development Policy.
- Wilson, E. O.
2006. *Creation: An Appeal to Save Life on Earth*. New York: WW Norton.
- 1999 (1992). *The Diversity of Life*. New York: WW Norton.